



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, November 19, 2013 – OLD BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:04 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Absent Members: None

Late Arrivals: Williams 5:05 p.m.; Coombs 5:05 p.m.

Early Departures: Hill-Holdgate 8:28 p.m.; McLaughlin 8:49 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

1. Soiree Floral	28 Centre Street	New sign: projecting sign	42.3.1-164	J. Almand
Sitting	Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	60623	

III. 60-DAY DENIALS

1. Farham, Marilyn	4 Elbow Lane – SAB	Hardscaping	73.2.4-30	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:05) Staff – Have received no correspondence in response to notifications. Read comments from last hearing.			
Motion	Motion to Deny due lack of response to requests for a complete application. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60624	

IV. OLD BUSINESS: QUORUM

1. Minella, Amy	8 Giny Lane	Hardscaping	41-847	W. Yost
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	William Yost – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:07) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 15. Barham – Had asked for information about a retaining wall along the east property line. Looking at the contours, it appears the driveway is going up four feet and there is a rise of 3-feet plus on the opposite side of the house. All contours have been adjusted; a concern with structures on the street has been the pattern of filling the properties and raising them up. There is almost no information on the original topography. Not in favor of a driveway that climbs 4 feet in 22 feet or filling in the embankment across the front of Lots 3 & 2. The house on Lot 3 looks to be 6 feet above the road and Lot 2 is only about 7 inches lower; there is no information on how is that transition going to happen across Lots 1, 2, & 3 to return to a more natural grade. Coombs – Agree with Mr. Barham. There is no information on the contours of Lot 1, which looked to be level with the street. Information requested: survey from Lot 4 to Lot 1 with current elevations and original elevations; parking might need to be reconsidered.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
2. Bermingham, Douglas	6 The Captain's Lane	New dwelling	30-619	W. Yost
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	William Yost Douglas Bermingham, owner			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:16) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 15. Need to submit legible reduced sets. Williams – Plate height is still 10 feet; that's need to come down. Hill-Holdgate – Dormer cheek walls need to be brought in and agree with Ms Williams. Barham – West elevation, there is a 2-foot change in elevation; however it is drawn as if the lot is flat; same problem as Giny Lane. Asked what the 1 st floor elevation is, nothing is labeled on the survey with a 2-foot drop in grade north to south. Agree about the dormers. In the shed dormers, both head casing and eave are not necessary. North elevation, the French doors should have kick panels and the panes similar in size to the windows. From the front, the wing left of the main mass is too large and too high. Coombs – Agree with what's been said. Front door should be a standard 6-panel door. Williams – Front door looks to be drawn incorrectly and the surround needs to be beefed up. The number of porch posts should be reduced on both the north and the south. Agree with what's been said. North elevation, the "A" windows don't work in the secondary element and are too big for the bumpout.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
2. Taaffe, James & Mary	20 Boulvarde	Pool house/gate	80-82	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:29) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 15. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried 2-1/Williams opposed	Certificate #	60625	

Proposed Minutes for November 19, 2013

3.	Maxey Pond Realty LLC	9 Maxey Pond Road	Garage	40-103	Rowland & Assoc.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ben Normand , Rowland and Associates – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:31) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 15. Discussion about the shingled rail. Hill-Holdgate – Would be approvable with “those” changes. Coombs – Agree with what’s been said of getting rid of the unnecessary brackets and the tail.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with no post or cap on the shingled rail, no brackets on the porch posts and removal of the stick detail from the bracket on the pent roof. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60626		
4.	Dunning, John	5 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Move on-site, addition	42.3.4-7	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Jamie Feeley, Cottage and Castle Construction Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:36) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 26. Hill-Holdgate – Would like to see the barn door remain red. McLaughlin – No comments. Williams – Would also like to see the barn door remain red.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the doors on the front to remain red, the trim harbor grey, sash black, and pergola natural to weather and the parking on the site plan redrawn in accordance with the hardscaping plan. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60627		
5.	Dunning, John	5 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	42.3.4-7	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development Jamie Feeley , Cottage and Castle Construction Inc. – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(5:44) Staff – No previous comments. Hill-Holdgate – No concerns with the rear. The driveway is fine. Granite is not an appropriate material; it should be simple brick walkway and typical lawn. Stoop should be traditional wood. Barham – Planting bed to the back, should have elevation of the tops and construction cut away. Agree about the front; needs to be traditional Nantucket. McLaughlin – No comments. Coombs – Agrees with what’s been said. Williams – Agrees.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

V. OLD BUSINESS: HDC FINAL SIGN-OFF

1. Cape Cod 5	112 Pleasant Street	Hardscaping: revisions	55-149	B L F & R Arch.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<p>Chris Raber, Cape Cod 5 – Reviewed changes to be made per concerns expressed on November 14. The curb cut to left of entrance driveway is being corrected per the approval this week. Working on getting a warmer bulb color.</p> <p>Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP</p> <p>Kurt Raber, Brown, Lindquist, Fenucci & Raber Architects – All bollards except those around the transformer will be cut down to 30 inches.</p>			
Public	None			
Concerns	<p>(5:52) Staff – November 14 minutes not included in file.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Would like to see a drawing of what they will look like and should be wood.</p> <p>Discussion about the colors of the bollards.</p> <p>Barham – Reviewed the locations of the bollards; galvanized bollards can be left to weather. The crosswalks between Dan's Pharmacy and the bank is very long and crosses two driveways; would like to see the painted crosswalk changed to Goshen Stone; feels this proposal is pedestrian unfriendly.</p> <p>Camp – In regards to the lighting, would like to see a warmer bulb used.</p> <p>Coombs – Asked what is between the brick walk and the painted cross walk. (Answer: hatch pattern was erased inadvertently.)</p> <p>Williams – Pleased with the direction it is going and it will be completed within a couple of weeks. Think it can be approved. Agree about the painted crosswalk.</p> <p>Discussion about how to handle the long crosswalk in a way that is coherent and provides a visual cue.</p>			
Motion	<p>Motion to Approve through staff with lamp posts to have the eagle finials removed, all bollards except at the transformer pad to be cut down to 30 inches painted white against white and grey or left natural where adjoin natural to weather cedar construction and black around the transformer, at the western exit from the drive-through creation of an extended brick island laid level with the pavement, the Belgium Block closest to the street to be replaced by asphalt, Belgium Block interior to the property to be as required by the Planning Board. (Barham)</p>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60628	

VI. OLD BUSINESS: VIEWS

1. Leo, Lori	7 Bluebird Lane	New dwelling	68-587	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	<p>(6:21) Staff – Need site plans and locus maps. Read colors. Applications reflects clapboard as not applicable.</p> <p>Hill-Holdgate – No concerns.</p> <p>Barham – The 6-panel front door is drawn with a transom as well as a fully developed architrave; cannot have both. Ground floor windows are set too low; there is too much space between the 1st and 2nd floor windows.</p> <p>Williams – All elevations show clapboard. Need to identify the colors and roof; need a locus map and site plan, identify siding; front door needs to be revised and the drawings are not ¼-inch scale.</p>			
Motion	<p>Motion to Hold for a complete application and ¼-inch scale drawings. (Coombs)</p>			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

2.	Leathbridge, Francis	48 Orange Street – HSAB	Renovation/addition	42.3.2-97	Skehel
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Chris Skehel , The Castle Group – Presented project. Had trouble finding historical information.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:27) Barham – West elevation, ambivalent about taking off the bay and going with the arrangement of windows which is probably what was there; the bay tells the story of the building. Wing to the right, hesitant about the roof and the shed dormer facing Orange Street is wrong; they ought to be small gable dormers individually set. East elevation, not in favor of the Juliet balcony and French door in the gable; would prefer to see the porch enclosed rather than adding the 2 nd floor. Not in favor of a roof walk that size. Hill-Holdgate – Agree with Mr. Barham. Would like to see the bay maintained. Having trouble with adding a second floor on that elevation. Coombs – East elevation, the 2 nd floor deck is wrong; there are too many decks already on that side. Agree with what's been said. McLaughlin – All four sides are visible. No access to the roof walk is shown on the plans. Williams – Also think the bay should remain. This roof walk is too big. There should not be a dormer facing Orange Street, but okay with the addition of a 2 nd floor. Need to get information about the age of the addition.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
3.	Miner, Tim	12 S. Valley Road	Hardscaping: pool, patio	43-139	B Champoux
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ben Champoux – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:38) Hill-Holdgate – No concerns. Barham – Asked if the pool could be set lower into the ground so that it isn't 4 feet out of the ground on the left side; that would be easier to screen. Coombs – Agree. McLaughlin – No comments.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the pool surround dropped an additional 15 inches, the insertion of 2 steps along the full length of the porch, no cobble apron, and include such length of retaining wall as is required around the spa per Exhibit A. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60629		
4.	Corbie ACK	10 Salros Road	New storage building	67-107	SCI/R. Newman
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Robert Newman , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Presented project. Neil Patterson				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:43) Hill-Holdgate – This is the last lot before the residential area; would like to see a design a little more barn-like for the garage in order to down play the commercial look. Coombs – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. McLaughlin – No comments. Williams – Would prefer 6-over-6 windows and agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. This is the longest structure on the street.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 6-over-6 windows, natural to weather trims and doors, and garage doors to be vertical board. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate # 60630		

Proposed Minutes for November 19, 2013

5.	Lampe, John	1 John Adams Lane	Hardscaping: pool	30-170.1	Atlantic Landscape
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Lindsey Congelton , Atlantic Landscaping – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:50) Williams – Would like to see the subdivision plan to help identify the location of the lot. Hill-Holdgate – The pool fence needs to be imbedded between two rows of plantings and pulled off the property line. Barham – Would like a top-of-wall height for the field stone and the pool. Need a finished floor height on the house to use as a benchmark.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for elevation information on the retaining wall, pool and house finished floor then placed on the consent agenda with that information. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
6.	Hayden, Thomas/Nancy	7 North Point	Addition, deck	38-81	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Chip Webster Architecture – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:56) Hill-Holdgate – South elevation, the 3 rd floor dormer is too heavy. Addition coming forward is overpowering; ganged window configuration in the gable is not approvable. McLaughlin – West elevation, the 2 nd floor “A” window headers should align with the smaller windows. Coombs – Front door is out of proportion; space between the “H” windows and 1 st floor is too large; ganged windows on the east side of that facade need to be separated. Transoms over the sliding doors should be eliminated. West elevation, the “B” windows lose the original shape. Barham – The garage should go on the other side and not obscure the existing main mass, which is proper to the island. The south elevation right side changes are the only appropriate changes. Williams – Agree with Mr. Barham. Concerned the transoms in the rear will catch the light.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
Break 7:05 to 7:15 p.m.					
7.	4 Cato Lane LLC	4 Cato lane	New dwelling	55-661	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(7:15) Hill-Holdgate –North elevation, the railing to the basement looks like chain link. The drawing is not ¼-inch scale. Meeting rails of the dormers need to align. Barham – West elevation, 2nd-story roof needs to come down; the eave is too high; the sides of the dormers need to come in; the 1 st floor windows are set high relative to the front door. North elevation, the dormer should be shorter and the 3 windows spaced; the windows are 6-over-6 or 4-over-1 while the rest of the house 6-over-1. The fence leading to the basement is a problem. Coombs – Agree about the windows all being 6-over-6. Structure is too tall for the neighborhood. South elevation dormers are too large. McLaughlin – West, south and north elevations, the dormer meeting rails have to align. Williams – West elevation, all windows in the addition are higher than the front door; they need to be reduced. Dormers are not properly proportioned. Nothing on this structure is right. The porch posts need to be beefed up. Windows can’t be 6 feet and should be 6-over-6. The “Chicklet” windows and 4-over-1s are not appropriate. South elevation, the vent in the side of the porch is not appropriate. Trim and rakes are too thin.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

8. Frazier, Pepper	7 Plum Street	New dwelling	80-26	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mark Cutone , BPC – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:27) Barham – South elevation, concerned about the 2 nd -floor deck on a “stunted H” scheme with a sizeable roof walk; dormer is too wide; same on the north elevation. From the south, it looks very long at a uniform height. The southwest porch is problematic. Roof walk should be on the main mass; and additive massing is atypical. Roof plan is not correct. Hill-Holdgate – Agree with Mr. Barham; this is too complex and the roof walk is not properly designed. The roof pitches are either too shallow or too high. Too many ganged windows; chaotic fenestration. This needs a significant revisit. Coombs – Nothing to add. McLaughlin – The “A” and “G” windows should be fixed or hoppers. Williams – Agree. This is a restart and the height needs to come down to around 25 feet.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
9. Williams, Fred	8 Tashama Lane	Additions	55-477	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:37) Hill-Holdgate – There is minimal visibility. Barham – The shed dormer is on a roof with 4-pitch; that brings the dormer way down. Discussion about changing the dormer.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
10. Swietlik, Albert	23 Old South Road	Addition	68-78	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project.			
Public	Albert Swietlik			
Concerns	(7:42) Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin & Coombs – No concerns. Barham – Porch posts need to be beefed up and there should be a window over the front door.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the 8X8 posts on the front porch and three windows across on the 2nd floor over the front door. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60631	

Proposed Minutes for November 19, 2013

11. Webster	2 Prospect Street – HSAB	Move-on: garage	55.4.4-3	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Paige Holdgate , Structures Unlimited – Presented project. Elizabeth Pascarelli – Garage doors will have sliding doors, not swinging.			
Public	Brook Meerbergen , for Joe Field at 28 Milk Street – The application shows a shed addition to the garage. The provided site plan shows the building under scale relative to what will actually be there. This garage is unnecessarily large for the lot and is located too close to the street in a neighborhood where most ancillary structures are to the rear. As it is presently proposed the doors will open out over a sidewalk. Scale should be reduced and relocated closer to the cottage.			
Concerns	(7:45) Hill-Holdgate – The garage goes on top of the present parking; it looks like there will be no space for outside parking. Need plans that show how the land is changing, the driveway is changing, and the sidewalk and probably should come more off the street. Barham – Agree very much with Mr. Meerbergen’s presentation. Saw no garage on the street along Milk Street; this is the wrong thing to do. It should be moved well back off the street far enough to park a car off the street while the doors are being opened and closed. The garage should be no more than a single bay. Coombs – Agree with what’s been said. McLaughlin – Agree about the set back and the doors should be wood. Williams – Agree with what’s been said. Need a better site plan.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and a complete site plan showing all buildings to scale and existing plantings. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
12. ViaVai LLC	11 Crooked Lane	New dwelling	41-205	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Subdivision plan submitted at the table.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Presented project. Explained access to the property and the reduced visibility.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:54) Williams – Need the subdivision map. Barham – Could not find the site. The south and west elevations will be visible and there might be an angled view of the east elevation. The site is sloping and the plans are drawn as if the lot is flat; need to know if there will be grading. Discussion about holding for Thursday to allow commissioners time to go view the ridge poles. McLaughlin – Anything above the 3 rd floor will be visible.			
Motion	Motion to View with further information and to come back on November 21 meeting. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

13. Preserve ACK		15 Meader Street – HSAB	New dwelling	42.2.3-45	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	Camp				
Recused	Coombs				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC – Explained the full project and presented this dwelling. Two applications for demolition were filed with HDC. The lot is elevation 5 and the structures need to be raised 5 feet to meet the impending 10-feet above flood plain FEMA requirements.				
	Terry Sanford				
Public	None				
Concerns	(8:02) Ms Williams insisted that Ms Coombs should recuse because this will be going to ZBA and Ms Coombs and her daughter are on the ZBA abutter list. Hill-Holdgate – This is a good approach. Like the simplicity of the roof line. Not sure about the round windows, they are atypical. The 6-over-1 windows are okay. The detail around the bottom should be straight vertical board, not framed. Barham – The parking is 4-wide on the street; to resemble Old North Wharf, the car parking would be drawn into the middle of the lot with the structures positioned accordingly. There are no 2-story houses on Meader Street; that character should be preserved. Would like a survey of the existing heights of all the structures. McLaughlin – The “D” windows should be fixed or hoppers. The two round windows should be eliminated. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with Mr. Barham that the area should be preserved as 1-story structures; 2-stories is not appropriate. Williams – Air-conditioning units (A/C) will have to be elevated. Don’t care about the rafter tails or the white trim.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and further information. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
14. Preserve ACK		15 Meader Street – HSAB	New dwelling	42.2.3-45	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC				
	Terry Sanford				
Public	None				
Concerns	(8:20) See previous comments.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and further information. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
15. Fortune Cookie LLC		5 Main Street – SAB	Renovation, addition	73.2.4-1	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(8:21) Barham – South elevation, the dormers on addition are larger and taller than those on the main house; need to be no larger and lower than those so as not to take precedence over the main house. The roof needs to drop some more; explained why. Hill-Holdgate – Would like something added that reads more as a front door. Coombs – Nothing to add. McLaughlin – On the north elevation 2 nd floor right has 5 awning windows; should be double hung.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

16.	79 Eel Pt. Rd. N.T.	79 Eel Point Road	Move off: main house	32-44	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger				
Recused	Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Modern structure moving off to 14 Bishops Rise.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(8:27) No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	60632
17.	14 Bishops Rise LLC	14 Bishops Rise	Move on: main house	40-124	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger				
Recused	Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(8:27) Barham – there are two very odd vents or windows up in the gable, which will be visible; they are inappropriate and need to be eliminated.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the gable ganged 4-light windows on the north elevation being removed. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	60633
18.	79 Eel Pt. Rd. N.T.	79 Eel Point Road	Move off: guest house	32-44	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger				
Recused	Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Modern structure moving off.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(8:27) No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	60634
23.	FAO Nominee Trust	3 Cash's Court – HSAB	New garage	42.3.2-150	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger				
Alternates	Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project.				
Public	Chris Skehel , The Castle Group, for 48 Orange Street – The design is appropriate.				
Concerns	(8:35) Barham – This will be very visible from Flora Street. The roof pitch is more shallow than customary; this should be approved with a 6-pitch roof. McLaughlin – The pitch should be 7 to meet the guidelines. Coombs – Agree with Mr. Barham. Leonardo-Finger – Okay with the 6 pitch.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a 6-pitch roof. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried 4-1/McLaughlin opposed			Certificate #	60635

24. 54 Fair Street LLC	54 Fair Street – HSAB	Move building	55.4.1-14	C. Skehel
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Skehel , The Castle Group – Reviewed changes made in response to previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:40) HSAB – Historical information needed, recommend view; historically significant; 3 against raising the structure. Barham – No objections going up enough to get the plate out of the ground, and use of a “Sconset” gutter. There should not be any basement windows facing the street; the board has turned those down in the past. Coombs – Agree with Mr. Barham. Camp – No concerns. McLaughlin – Elevations don’t show cellar windows or the material of the wells.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with one 6-light top-sash basement window under the west elevation left window. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60636	
25. McClusky, Katherine	3 Traders Lane – HSAB	Renovation	42.3.3-116	Bockus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs. Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	Barham			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 21 meeting. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
26. Kaplan	37 Hulbert Avenue	Addition	29-20	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Request held for November 21 meeting.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:48) No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 21 meeting. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
27. Kahan	19 Bishops Rise	Major revisions	40-31.3	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Request held for November 21 meeting.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:48) No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 21 meeting. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

VI. OLD BUSINESS				
1. Yates, Chris	7 New Lane – HSAB	New dwelling: revisions	41-285	SCI/R. Newman
2. Yates, Chris	7 New Lane – HSAB	Demo dwelling to track	41-285	SCI/R. Newman
Motion	Held for November 21 due to lack of quorum.			
Vote	N/A	Certificate #		
3. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Cabana	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:49) Staff – Read previous concerns. Barham – North elevation (as indicated on the drawings), should have 2-foot returns at the end walls. Williams – Cardinal points are wrong.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the cardinal points corrected and 2-foot returns on the west elevation. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60637	
4. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Hardscaping: pool & fence	80-196	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:54) No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60638	
5. LTS Ginger	5 Blackfish Lane – SAB	New house	73-122	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	James Krapp, Workshop/APD – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:55) Staff – Read previous concerns. Leonardo-Finger – The chimney should come in. South elevation, the front door should be traditional, 4-panel with 2 lights. North elevation dormer cheek walls should be pulled in 6 inches. Question the lack of visibility as the area is open. Williams – Still have the same concerns. South elevation, the “G” windows are inappropriate; should be “F” windows. East elevation dormer cheek walls need to come in 4 inches.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation dormer cheek walls each brought in 6 inches, the east elevation dormer cheek walls each brought in 4 inches, north elevation the “G” windows become 2-over-2 “F” windows, and the front door a 4-panel with two lights and A/C units screened behind a Type II natural to weather 3-foot fence Per Exhibit A. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60639	

6. LTS Ginger	5 Blackfish Lane – SAB	New shed	73-122	Workshop/APD
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	James Krapp , Workshop/APD – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(9:04) Staff – No previous concerns. Site plan is wrong.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with an appropriate site plan. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60640
Rest of agenda items held for November 21 meeting.				
7. Haub, Christian	57 Eel Point Road	Revisions: 2 nd dwelling	32-46	Workshop/APD
8. Bluefin Partners	16 Ellens Way	Revisions: house	81-6	Workshop/APD
9. Bluefin Partners	16 Ellens Way	Revisions: pool	81-6	Workshop/APD
10. Bluefin Partners	28 Ellens Way	Revisions: house	81-6	Workshop/APD
11. Bluefin Partners	28 Ellens Way	Revisions: pool	81-6	Workshop/APD
12. Bluefin Partners	26 Ellens Way	Revisions: house	81-6	Workshop/APD
13. Bluefin Partners	26 Ellens Way	Revisions: pool	81-6	Workshop/APD
14. Dukes 53 LLC	53 Dukes Road	Renovation/addition	56-185.4	Rowland & Assoc.
28. Grimshaw, Gloria`	2C Winn Street	AS-BUILT changes	41-183	BPC
29. Domboys Realty Trust	2B Winn Street	AS-BUILT changes	41-183	BPC
15. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New Dwelling	30-193	Emeritus
16. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	Garage to track with dwelling	30-193	Emeritus
17. Forgarty	19 Masaquet Avenue	Revisions: new dwelling	80-140	Emeritus
18. Glenhurst West RT	137 Cliff Road	Revisions: new dwelling	30-259	CWA
19. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	Revisions: new dwelling	15-43	CWA
20. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	2 nd dwelling to track	15-43	CWA
21. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	Garage to track	15-43	CWA
22. Dyer, Paul	20 Tashama Lane	Revisions to Cert 27412	55-450	Link
23. Dyer, Paul	20 Tashama Lane	Revisions to Cert 33491	55-450	Link

VII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes -	November 5 th Motion to Approve. (Barham) Carried 4-0/ Williams abstain.
Review Minutes -	November 12 th , 14 th
Other Business -	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Executive Session: Status and clarification of 8 Milestone Road - Held •Discussion on agenda/meeting composition: not segregating old/new business meetings - Held •8 North Water Street hardscaping/ granite curbing in OHD: Barham – Looked at the stone and saw nothing amiss. Once it dirties down, it will fit in. Chris Skehel, The Castle Group – It is the stone HDC required. Remove from agenda •13 Blackfish Lane electrical panel: Staff – The electrical panel, transformer, equipment box along, and other issues with the structure are to be applied for. •157 Main Street fence violation: Williams – Wants the violation notice to be issued immediately. There is a 4-foot board fence all across the front of the property. Need to have a motion to send the letter. Barham – Would like the opportunity to view this before action is taken. Motion to send letter to the property owner informing of the violation. (Barham) Carried unanimously •HDC procedure at meetings (McLaughlin)
Commission Comments	<p>Barham – Identified a possible violation on the property behind “Fortune Cookie LLC”. Would like an update on the Andrews property opposite 56 Union Street; wants this on a future agenda.</p> <p>Barham – Stone number bollards are appearing all over the island; should not be 4 ½ street high; propose and discussion to set a policy.</p>

Motion to Adjourn: 9:15 p.m.

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton